March 10, 2025

Clerk of the Board of Supervisors
1600 Pacific Highway,
San Diego, CA, 91950

Cc;
Andrew.Potter@sdcounty.ca.gov
Teresa.Zurita@sdcounty.ca.gov
Jminto@cityofsanteeca.gov
Esanchez@oceansideca.org

Re: Proposal for City Selection Committee Tie Breaking Procedure

Dear City Selection Committee Clerk and voting members,

On behalf of the organizations signed onto this letter, the Environmental Health Coalition (EHC) urges you to reject the proposed tiebreaker procedure in Section 5C and adopt the following courses of action.

1) In the event of an impasse vote, representative seats **should not** be filled by the entire membership of the City Selection Committee.

2) **In the event of an impasse, a procedure should be adopted to allow the most populated city representative within the City Selection Committee subcommittee specified in Section 4.5(B) to be the tie breaking vote.**

After two rounds of voting at the January 13th 2025 City Selection Committee meeting, City Selection subcommittee members were unable to come to an agreement on the representative for the District 3 supervisorial seat on the San Diego Air Pollution Control Districts Governing Board. Because the process is not specified in the rules and regulations that describes what would happen in the event of a tie, we urge the County's City Selection Committee to take these actions to ensure that the appointment to the Air Pollution Control District's Governing Board be done in the most thoughtful and equitable way possible.

1) **In the event of an impasse vote, the City Selection Committee should not allow non district 3 representatives to dictate its supervisorial districts APCD leaders.**

In the event of an impasse to appoint the next District 3 representative on SDAPCD, the City Selection Committee should not resolve an impasse by a vote of the entire body. Doing so will violate one of the key principles of Environmental Justice – which calls for the self determination of communities. [1]

District 3 should be able to dictate the representative for their region on the Air Pollution Control District – free from the political, cultural and social influences of communities in different parts of the County. The Mayors of National City and Imperial Beach should not decide who represents Escondido or San Marcos on APCD, and we fear that allowing a tie breaking vote by the entire City Selection Committee will set a dangerous precedent allowing this exact scenario to happen.

---

[1] https://www.ejnet.org/ej/principles.pdf

In 2013, the Barrio Logan Community Plan Update was referendized – permitting City of San Diego Residents from communities like La Jolla and San Ysidro to vote on the Community Plan of Barrio Logan. Ultimately, the 2013 measure to create a buffer between polluting industry and residents failed at the ballot box.[2] This is an example of how regional voting schemes have negative consequences resulting in delayed progress on issues of localized importance.

Representation on the APCD Governing Board is representation of impacted populations by their local representatives. The cities of Del Mar, Carlsbad, Encinitas, Solana Beach, Coronado and San Diego deserve the right to self-select their Air District representative – like every other supervisorial district in the county has. Having Mayors across the County, decide the representation of a district they have no responsibility to, goes against the spirit and intent of AB 423 by effectively removing the agency of the District to decide their own Representative.

2) **The City Selection Committee should adopt a procedure in the event of a subcommittee impasse, to allow the most populated city representative within the city selection subcommittee specified in Section 4.5(B) to cast a tie breaking vote.**

In District 3 there are 6 cities represented in city selection subcommittee – Carlsbad, Encinitas, Del Mar, Coronado, Solana Beach and City of San Diego[3] [4]. In an attempt to promote the most equitable outcome, we propose that the most populated city within each supervisorial district have tiebreaking authority in the event of a stalemate tie between subcommittee members. This framework will allow the City representatives from communities that would be impacted the most from air regulations and policies passed by the Air District to have a weighed say on the districts leadership.

Based on the current supervisorial district configurations there are 4 district subcommittees where a possible impasse vote can occur – District 1 (where there are 4 cities), District 2 (where there are 4 cities), District 3 (where there are 6 cities) and District 5 (where there are 4 cities). EHC's analysis reveals that the city of San Diego's representative - barring dramatic shifts in population concentrations - will have the tiebreaking authority under this framework for Districts 2 and 3. For District 1, the City of Chula Vistas subcommittee representative will have tiebreaking power in the event of an impasse, and for District 5 the city of Oceanside's subcommittee representative will have tie breaking authority.

District 1 Subcommittee Membership and Population Summary	
Chula Vista	**274,333[5]**
National City	55,236[6]
Imperial Beach	25,458[7]
City of San Diego[8]	~121,000

[2] https://ballotpedia.org/City_of_San_Diego_Barrio_Logan_Community_Plan_Update_Referendums,_Measure_B_%26_Measure_C_(June_2014)

[3] The communities from the City of San Diego that are within the boundaries of the District 3 Supervisorial District include; La Jolla, Little Italy, Midway, Mira Mesa, Mission Beach, Ocean Beach, Pacific Highlands, Point Loma, Rancho Penasquitos, Sorrento Valley, Torrey Highlands, Pacific Beach, University City, and Carmel Valley
[4] https://www.supervisorterralawsonremer.com/content/d3/us/en/about/about-district-3.html
[5] https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/chulavistacitycalifornia/PST045224
[6] https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/nationalcitycitycalifornia/PST045224
[7] https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/imperialbeachcitycalifornia/PST045224

[8] **San Diego Communities total population = ~121,000. Communities in D1 within the city of san diego are as follows;** San Ysidro (16,752)[4], Otay Mesa, Barrio Logan (2400)[5], Logan Heights (13,725)[6], East Village (16088)[7], Golden Hill (9081)[8], Grant Hill (3939)[9], Lincoln Park (9484)[10], Memorial, Mount Hope (5,184)[11] , Mountain View (15,326)[12] , Nestor (16,636)[13], Sherman Heights (2787)[14], Southcrest (6084)[15], Stockton (3322)[16]

District 2 Subcommittee Membership and Population Summary	
City of San Diego[9]	**Greater than 183,523**
El Cajon	102,337[10]
Santee	60,037[11]
Poway	48,058[12]

District 3 Subcommittee Membership and Population Summary	
City of San Diego[13]	***328,713***
Carlsbad	113,018[14]
Encinitas	61,942[15]
Coronado	18,532[16]
Solana Beach	12,946[17]
Del Mar	3,841[18]

District 5 Subcommittee Membership and Population Summary	
Oceanside	**170,020[19]**
Vista	98,344 [20]
San Marcos	94,188 [21]
Escondido	148,122 [22]

We appreciate the opportunity to engage on this important matter and hope that our suggestions are taken into consideration.

Kindly,

Environmental Health Coalition

Climate Action Campaign

---

[9] Communities counted include; Allied Gardens (11,909)[4] , Carmel Mountain Ranch, Del Cerro (7,164)[5], Grantville, Kearny Mesa (3,171)[6] , MCAS Miramar, Miramar Ranch, Rancho Bernardo (45,000)[7] , Sabre Springs (10,000)[8] , San Carlos (14,383)[9] , San Pasqual Valley, Scripps Ranch (18,013)[10] , Serra Mesa (36,883)[11], Stonebridge, Tierrasanta (37,000)[12]

[10] https://www.elcajon.gov/discover-el-cajon/about/demographics
[11] https://www.cityofsanteeca.gov/business/economic-development/population--demographics
[12] https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/powaycitycalifornia/PST045223

[13] Communities counted in City of San Diego totals; La Jolla - 27,856 **people**[1]**, Mira Mesa -** 61,921 [2], *Mission Beach - 4055*[3], *Ocean Beach - 10,964*[4], *Pacific Beach – 47,000*[5], *Carmel Valley – 39,000* [6], *University City – 56,000*[7], *Pacific Highlands – 5000* [8], *Rancho Penasquitos –* 44,291 [9], *Sorrento Valley – 4,150* [10], *Torrey Highlands – 8715* [11], *Point Loma – 6,283* [12], *Midway – 11,643* [13], *Little Italy – 1835* [14]

[14] https://worldpopulationreview.com/us-cities/california/carlsbad
[15] https://www.point2homes.com/US/Neighborhood/CA/Encinitas-Demographics.html
[16] https://worldpopulationreview.com/us-cities/california/coronado
[17] https://www.point2homes.com/US/Neighborhood/CA/Solana-Beach-Demographics.html
[18] https://worldpopulationreview.com/us-cities/california/del-mar
[19] https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/oceansidecitycalifornia/PST045223
[20] https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/vistacitycalifornia/PST045223
[21] https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/sanmarcoscitycalifornia/PST045223
[22] https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/escondidocitycalifornia/PST045223